

Fifth Meeting of the Climate Risk and Early Warning Systems Initiative (CREWS) Steering Committee

8 November 2017, Bonn, Germany

DRAFT MEETING REPORT

The objective of the CREWS initiative is to significantly increase the capacity to generate and communicate effective impact-based, multi-hazard, gender-informed, early warnings and risk information to protect lives, livelihoods, and assets in Least Developed Countries (LDCs) and small island developing States (SIDS).

CREWS Members



Australia



France (Chair)



Germany



Luxembourg



Netherlands

CREWS Observers



Canada



Japan



New Zealand



Norway



Switzerland



USAID



ACP

CREWS Implementing Partners



Summary of Proceedings and Decisions

1. The Fifth Meeting of the CREWS Steering Committee was held on 8 November 2017, Bonn, Germany.
2. Representatives from Australia, Canada, France, Germany, Japan, Luxembourg, New Zealand, The Netherlands, the Global Facility for Disaster Reduction and Recovery (GFDRR), the World Meteorological Organization (WMO), the World Bank, United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) and United Nations Office for Disaster Risk Reduction (UNISDR) attended the meeting (Annex 1—list of participants).

Agenda item 1 - Welcome, Adoption of the Agenda, Decisions Taken at the Fourth Meeting

3. The Chair of the CREWS Steering Committee, Ms. Brigitte Collet, French Ambassador for Climate Change Negotiations, Renewable Energy and Climate Risk Prevention outlined the objectives of the meeting followed by the adoption of the agenda (Annex 2—Meeting Agenda).
4. In the review of Decisions taken at the Fourth Meeting (CREWS/SC.5/ infdoc.1), the Secretariat announced the completion of the CREWS website in English and French. The website includes project tracking pages that reflect status of progress. The Chair informed of ongoing efforts to mobilize potential new contributors to the CREWS FIF, including the organization of a high level event during the COP on 15 November 2017.
5. The Secretariat informed that the template for project reporting based on the CREWS results-based monitoring framework was rolled out and CREWS Implementing Partners had used it to report their activities. The first CREWS annual report is in production and will be available by March 2018.
6. The Secretariat contributed to the African Ministerial Conference on Meteorology (AMCOMET) – Africa Hydromet Forum, 12-15 September 2017 in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia organized by the African Union Commission with the support of WMO, the World Bank and other international partners. Consultations were also held with Caribbean countries regarding the proposed CREWS project. The staff member seconded to the Secretariat by the World Bank will begin her functions on 1 November 2017.

Agenda item 2 - Status and Results of the CREWS Programme

7. The representative from the Trustee reported on the financial status of the CREWS Trust Fund, referring to the report prepared by the Trustee as of 30 September 2017 (CREWS/SC.5/infdoc.6/Trust Fund Financial Report).
8. All pledged amounts have now been signed into contribution agreements for a total of USD 22.2 million. Of this amount, USD 17.6 million had been received in cash from contributors, with USD 4.6 million still to be received between 2018-2020 in accordance with instalment schedules in the agreements. The Trustee reported that instalments due to be paid in FY2018 amounted to USD 1.9 million and that if these were received, and the WMO Papua New Guinea project proposed for approval at this meeting were approved, the additional amounts available for new commitments by the Steering Committee up to 30 June 2018 would amount to USD 2.4 million.
9. The Trustee noted that the Administrative Budget for the Secretariat and Trustee for FY19 would need to be committed before this date, and recommended that an amount be kept in reserve to

ensure sufficient funds were available to permit continued administration of CREWS. The Trustee also noted the minimum total contribution amount of USD 100 million for similar financial intermediary funds for which the World Bank provides trustee services and welcomed the Steering Committee's focus on a financing plan to reach this amount.

10. The Trustee informed the Steering Committee that the World Bank's Single Audit of Trust Funds, including CREWS, was now available and may be accessed by contributors through the World Bank's website at address: <http://fiftrustee.worldbank.org>.
11. The Secretariat introduced the country project reports by referring to the Operational Procedures Note N°2 on Monitoring and Evaluation, which details CREWS reporting requirements and includes the CREWS Monitoring Framework. The highest objective of the Framework is Target A of the Sendai Framework for Disaster Risk Reduction; "a substantial reduction in global disaster mortality". All CREWS project activities should demonstrate their contribution to achieving this high-level outcome by measuring their progress against the Framework's eight Outputs.
12. CREWS has an established reporting timeline. Once to the Steering Committee's June meeting, on projects' activities, and once to the Steering Committee's meeting on the side of the UNFCCC COPs in November, on projects' results, and through its annual report every March.
13. The Chair invited project progress reports by region, starting with Africa. The WMO representative noted that the Burkina Faso project started in July 2017 with the objective of building technical and service capacity for issuing forecasts for severe weather and flooding, in particular for the agricultural sector. A recent assessment revealed that there are hundreds of weather stations in the country that are not reporting. It will be a project priority to ensure the stations report to the National Meteorology Agency, ANAM, to improve forecasts. Another effort is on data rescue as historical data is on paper and needs to be digitized to be used in forecasting. These records enable hindcasting by providing return periods for extreme events.
14. World Bank and GFDRR colleagues reported on progress in Mali, Democratic Republic of Congo (DRC) and Niger reiterating that these projects are leveraging resources from the World Bank, the European Union, and the Green Climate Fund (GCF).
15. Mali was the first project approved and an internal trust fund was set up. As the implementation plan was adopted by the Government last September, a few activities have already been undertaken to support capacity building. According to the World Bank, an initial feedback from the implementation of CREWS projects in Africa is the productive cooperation between the countries, WMO and the World Bank.
16. In Niger, the project started at the end of September. The implementation plan was adopted by the Government in October and the project will focus on better linking the institutions that develop forecasts with those who communicate them to people. CREWS is building on initial GFDRR investment to map flood risk at local level by supporting flood early warnings through those relationships. The Niger project is led by the Disaster Risk Reduction Agency, while the other CREWS project (such as Mali and DRC) are led by meteorology and hydrology agencies.
17. For the project in the DRC, the implementation plan was adopted by the Government at the end of July and initial activities have been undertaken such as the recruitment of experts for priority assignments and capacity-building for local stakeholders involved in early warning.

18. The WMO representative noted that for the CREWS Pacific Region project, implementation is underway. The project is co-financed with Canada. The project steering committee, composed of the countries and partners involved in the region, met and approved the overall implementation plan with some adjustments.
19. Activities undertaken include: a mapping of on-going projects for hydro-meteorological development in the region to refine the CREWS Pacific project contribution to the Pacific Islands Meteorological Strategy (PIMS); workshops for the implementation of the Common Alerting Protocol (CAP) in Niue, Tuvalu, Fiji, Palau, Nauru, Papua New Guinea and the Federated States of Micronesia; a television weather presentation workshop in Fiji; an assessment of the need for strategic plans and meteorological bills; a strategic plan for the Fiji Meteorological Service (FMS) (in final approval); a procurement needs assessment for the Severe Weather Forecasting and Demonstration Project (SWFDP) component of the project; and identification of ICT equipment needs for the targeted NMHSs.
20. France welcomed the compilation of project progress compiled by the CREWS Secretariat and suggested that in addition the individual project reports by the Implementing Partners be uploaded to the CREWS website. The Netherlands welcome the practice of referring in CREWS proposals to other ongoing projects in the countries. The representative also suggested that CREWS Contributing Members refer, as appropriate to CREWS projects in the boards of other funds.
21. It was also suggested that the embassies of CREWS Members, in project countries, be informed of the investments initiated in the countries, as well as the status of ongoing work, including when expert visits take place. The Chair suggested that the French Government could assist in this regard.
22. Germany requested further clarification on how the CREWS projects in Africa contribute to efforts to develop insurances in the region with a reference to the agriculture sector. The WMO representative noted that CREWS investments in data rescue and strengthened ground-based observing systems provides the historical and continuously updated climate data required for designing and implementing index insurance schemes. This data is currently not always available at the right level of detail. The local data is further required to verify remotely sensed data and regional re-analyses. Greater efforts are required to involve national meteorological service and other relevant national authorities to promote this data access and sustainability.

Agenda item 3 - Review of CREWS Projects for Approval and Pipeline Countries

23. The Chair referred to *Decision 7 – 3rd Steering Committee* which approved the project entitled ‘Weather and Climate Early Warning System for Papua New Guinea’ (CREWS/CProj/08/Papua New Guinea) into a pipeline for fund allocation upon availability of funds in the CREWS FIF.
24. She also referred to the subsequent communication from the Secretariat to the CREWS Contributing Partners for a decision on the allocation of funds from the CREWS Trust Fund, under a no-objection procedure for the project. As no objections were received the project was approved.
25. The Chair invited the Implementing Partners to present the CREWS Regional Project for Western Africa (CREWS/RProj/02/Western Africa) for the Steering Committee’s consideration.

26. The WMO representative noted that the proposed project encapsulates cooperation among the Implementing Partners, the involvement of NMHSs in peer-to-peer support (Burkina Faso, Mali, Niger, Netherlands and Germany), a circulating regional-national information exchange among national and regional centres, and the leveraging of other investments (the latter detailed in an annex of the project proposal). The project would link with CREWS country projects as well as other national and regional projects carried out by other partners. The WMO representative noted that the project involves three regional centers (ACMAD, AGRYMET, RSMC Dakar), and would therefore assist in covering other parts of the Sahel region. The Netherlands (KNMI) welcomed the approach and noted that data sharing is cost-effective and brings substantial benefits. The WMO representative also noted that a connection with European centers will be explored.
27. The Chair invited the Implementing Partners to present the CREWS Regional Project for the Caribbean for the Steering Committee's consideration. The GFDRR representative presented the project "Strengthening Hydro-Meteorological and Early Warning Services in the Caribbean" (CREWS/RProj/04/Regional Project Caribbean) and detailed its three components: development of a regional strategy to strengthen and streamline early warning and hydromet services; institutional strengthening and streamlining of early warning and hydromet services; and support for piloting high-priority national activities including impact-based forecasting. The project would start as soon as funding were available and the findings from the lessons-learned project (see below) would be used to adjust the deliveries. Although there is significant national investment in the Caribbean States and Territories, there is need to bring these investments together regionally through CREWS support.
28. The Chair invited the Implementing Partners to present the project "Lessons Learnt on Early Warning Systems Following the Caribbean 2017 Hurricane Season" (CREWS/RProj/05/Lessons Learnt Caribbean) for the Steering Committee's consideration. The WMO representative informed that the project would be an eight-month exercise to collect and analyze information on the adequacy of the region's early warning systems based on their performance and the impact of the last hurricane season. The findings would be incorporated into the larger regional project.
29. France enquired on the countries that had been included in the CREWS Investment Plan, namely Haiti, Curacao and St Lucia and were not mentioned in the regional proposal. The World Bank clarified that the national component of the project would be defined after the regional lessons learnt to take into consideration the changing needs and other investment following the 2017 hurricane season.
30. Members discussed the approach to prioritize between the proposed two regional projects. As they would only be approved once sufficient resources are available in the Trust Fund, it was suggested that the decision on prioritization would be taken once the resources are available. At the same time a decision on the allocation of funds for national components of the Caribbean project would be taken.

Decision 1 - 5th Steering Committee: The project entitled "Weather and Climate Early Warning System for Papua New Guinea" (CREWS/CProj/08/Papua New Guinea) is approved for funding as described in Annex 3 to this Report.

Decision 2 - 5th Steering Committee: The project entitled "Lessons Learnt on Early Warning Systems Following the Caribbean 2017 Hurricane Season" (CREWS/RProj/05/Lessons Learnt Caribbean) is approved for funding as described in Annex 3 to this Report.

Decision 3 - 5th Steering Committee: The regional project entitled “Seamless operational forecast systems and technical assistance for capacity building in West Africa” (CREWS/RProj/02/Western Africa) and the regional project entitled “Strengthening Hydro-Meteorological and Early Warning Services in the Caribbean” (CREWS/RProj/04/Regional Project Caribbean) are approved pending availability of funds in the CREWS Financial Intermediary Fund (FIF). The Steering Committee will discuss the prioritization for funding upon the availability of funds. The project CREWS/RProj/05/Lessons Learnt Caribbean is expected to contribute findings to the CREWS/RProj/04/Regional Project Caribbean.

31. In order to guide future investment decisions by of the Steering Committee regarding potential additional country projects, the Chair recommended reviewing the current list of countries referred to as Pipeline Countries in the CREWS Investment Plan.

32. The Secretariat referred to the current mapping of LDCs and SIDS to guide early warning as a value-add of CREWS in order to promote a more programmatic approach to investment decisions. The criteria for mapping of early warning systems status and needs in SIDS and LDCs are found in the annex of the CREWS Operational Procedures Note N^o1 on Programming and Project Development.

33. Germany referred to a risk atlas being developed by the United Nations University (UNU), that can contribute to the review of the pipeline countries.

Decision 4 - 5th Steering Committee: The CREWS Secretariat is requested, in consultation with the Implementing Partners, to propose a revised list of the CREWS Pipeline Countries for the 6th Meeting of the CREWS Steering Committee, based on an updated mapping of the level of demand, risk and leveraging potential.

Agenda item 4 - CREWS Analytics for Early Warning Effectiveness

34. The Chair invited the Secretariat to present a proposed set of analytics on measuring early warning access and effectiveness, with a view to assist countries to measure the effectiveness of their early warning systems and to set a baseline to measure the efficiency of CREWS investments.

35. The Secretariat recalled that the United Nations undertook a global review of early warning systems in 2005 and that a number of regional reviews have been carried out since. CREWS is the only dedicated fund to early warning systems and as such, in particular through the Implementing Partners, can contribute to help countries measure their early warning system effectiveness.

36. A measurement framework was presented for expert validation at the Multi-Hazard Early Warning Conference in Cancun in May 2017. It was used, for example, for the CREWS Caribbean Stocktaking. The framework needs to be further developed iteratively in order to develop effective guidance on how to measure early warning effectiveness.

37. Opportunities to further strengthen the analytics include post-disaster contexts. Countries are requesting support in reviewing early warnings after disasters. For example, Sierra Leone has asked WMO to review the effectiveness of its early warning system for landslides in August 2017 and the methodology developed in the context of CREWS will be applied. The Secretariat requested the Steering Committee’s support to continue this work and apply it in countries.

38. A member noted that the newly established Global Centre of Excellence on Adaptation, which Netherlands launched with Japan and UN Environment at COP23, will be measuring adaptation

projects' effectiveness to learn what works and what does not. CREWS work in assessing early warning effectiveness would be a useful contribution.

39. A member suggested including gender equality as part of the early warning analytics, in line with the commitment of CREWS to gender sensitive-programming.

40. UNISDR referred to the ongoing efforts by countries to measure the seven Targets of the Sendai Framework on Disaster Risk Reduction. The CREWS analytics work on early warning would contribute more specifically to the Target G, namely to: "substantially increase the availability of and access to multi-hazard early warning systems and disaster risk information and assessments to the people by 2030.

Decision 5 - 5th Steering Committee: CREWS Implementing Partners, with the support of the CREWS Secretariat, to work with countries where CREWS has projects, to apply the draft analytics to review the effectiveness of their early warning systems and to learn from their application in countries post-disasters.

Agenda item 5 - Financing Plan for the CREWS FIF

41. Presentation for consideration by the Steering Committee of a revised investment case and refinancing strategy for the CREWS FIF.

42. The Chair noted that, currently, the focus of CREWS has been mostly on operationalizing its activities in countries. CREWS has a relatively high disbursement rate (over 70% for the FIF). With the ability to show early results and the growing demand for CREWS portfolios by other LDCs and SIDS a stronger focus needs to be put on mobilizing additional resources.

43. The target set at Sendai and reiterated at COP21 is US\$ 100 million by 2020. This would allow the upscaling of CREWS to cover half the LDCs and SIDS that require effective early warning systems. The Secretariat developed, and presented at the 4th Steering Committee meeting, the outline of an investment case. The Secretariat also consulted with the Implementing Partners, who recommended to put the investment case in the context of a wider resource mobilization plan. The resource mobilization plan will deepen relations with existing donors, aim to diversify the donor base, demonstrate the results and advantage of supporting CREWS, and link to the CREWS Investment Plan 2016-2020.

44. The Chair reiterated that mobilizing resources is a collective effort that the Secretariat cannot undertake on its own. The Implementing Partners are well connected and are engaging in this process. The Chair reiterated her request that contributing members promote CREWS and further encouraged Observers to become contributing members. There are opportunities to showcase CREWS at events such as the 12 December 2017 One Planet Summit in Paris and the World Bank Spring Meetings, among others.

45. The WMO representative noted that an added value of CREWS is its emphasis on transparency, coordination and leveraging of resources. Donors might be able to discuss using CREWS and such mechanisms to build coherence to make effective use of some of the available funding.

46. The Chair highlighted the events at COP23 to showcase CREWS visibility and invited other Steering Committee members to champion CREWS.

47. One member queried if CREWS had been discussed in the context of the 2018 G7 Summit in Canada. The Secretariat informed that it is not aware this has been the case.

Decision 6 - 5th Steering Committee: The CREWS Secretariat, in consultation with the Implementing Partners and the Chair, is requested to finalize the investment case and refinancing strategy for the CREWS Financial Intermediary Fund by February 2018.

Agenda item 6 - Any Other Business and Dates for the 6th and 7th Meetings

48. The Secretariat presented the CREWS website, www.crews-initiative.org. Members asked for clarity from the Secretariat on which of the Steering Committee documents are publicly available on the website. Members recognized the importance of transparency and accountability in all aspects of CREWS operations and asked the Secretariat to propose a policy for information disclosure, based on practices in similar multi-donor trust funds, prior to uploading Steering Committee documents on the website. The Netherlands suggested to anonymize the minutes of the Steering Committee, regarding interventions by countries. Australia suggested the publication of a short summary of Steering Committee deliberations that could be made public on the CREWS website. Whereas the publication of Steering Committee Decisions was welcomed, members expressed the need for further clarity on the procedures to make Steering Committee deliberations publically available.

49. The representative of GFDRR mentioned the Understanding Risk Forum to be held 14-18 May 2018 in Mexico City, Mexico and invited CREWS partners to participate and further suggested the next CREWS Steering Committee could take place in the margins of the Forum. The Chair pointed out the risk of overlapping with the UNFCCC Subsidiary Body meetings.

Decision 7 - 5th Steering Committee: The Sixth Meeting of the CREWS Steering Committee is to be held, as a half-day video-connection meeting of the Contributing Partners, the Implementing Partners, the Trustee, and the Secretariat, and to tentatively take place in mid-June 2018.

Decision 8 - 5th Steering Committee: The Seventh Meeting of the CREWS Steering Committee is proposed to be a half day face-to-face meeting (for Contributing Partners, Observers, the Implementing Partners, the Trustee, and the Secretariat) at the end of 2018.

Annex I - List of Participants

Contributing Partners		
France (Chair)	Ms Brigitte Collet	Ambassador for Climate Change Negotiations, Renewable Energy and Climate Risk Prevention
	Ms Marie-Claire L'Henry	Head International and European Affairs Unit
	Mr Philippe Cerf	Advisor to Ambassador for Climate Change Negotiations, Renewable Energy and Climate Risk Prevention
	Mr Michaël Chouraki	Desk Officer, Ministry for Europe and Foreign Affairs
Germany	Mr Christoph von Stechow	Senior Policy Officer Division Climate Policy Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development
The Netherlands	Ms Marjolein Geusebroek	Senior Policy Advisor Climate Team
	Mr Arnout Feijt	Researcher, Royal Netherlands Meteorological Institute
Luxembourg	Mr George Gehl	Coordination et affaires générales; Changement climatique - mise en oeuvre du plan d'action national
	Ms Cheryl Dentzer	Attachée de Gouvernement au Ministère du Développement Durable et des Infrastructures - Département de l'Environnement
Australia	Mr Simon Ernst	Director, Humanitarian, NGOs and Partnership division, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade
Observers		
New Zealand	Ms Alysha Bagasra	Policy Analyst, Ministry for Primary Industries
Japan	Mr Seiichi Urauchi	Deputy Director, Climate Change Division, International Cooperation Bureau, Ministry of Foreign Affairs
	Ms Keiko Yamamoto (on-line)	Official Climate Change Division International Cooperation Bureau Ministry of Foreign Affairs
Canada	Ms Hearther Aucoin (on-line)	Manager, International Relations, Meteorological Service of Canada
UNDP	Ms Uthira Ravikumar	Preparedness Programme Analyst
Implementing Partners		
GFDRR	Mr Francis Ghesquire	Head of the Secretariat for the Global Facility for Disaster Reduction & Recovery
	Ms Manuela Chiapparino	Team Leader GFDRR Europe and European Donors Relations
	Mr Vladimir Tsirkunov (on-line)	Team Leader of GFDRR's Weather and Climate Information for Decision Support (WCIDS) Program
	Mr Jean-Baptiste Migraine (on-line)	Senior Disaster Risk Reduction Specialist Africa Region
	Ms Henriette Mampuya	Disaster Risk Management Analyst
	Ms Cristina Otano	Senior Partnership Specialist
	Ms Beverley Mbu	Legal Consultant
	Mr Stephan Zimmerman	Junior Professional Officer
WMO	Ms Cindy Robles	Junior Professional Officer
	Mr Maxx Dilley	Director Climate Prediction and Adaptation Branch
UNISDR	Mr Jean-Paul Gaudechoux	Senior Programme Manager, Office for Resource Mobilisation and Development Partnerships
	Ms Shoko Arakaki (on-line)	Chief of Partnerships, Inter-governmental process

		and Inter-agency cooperation branch
	Mr David Stevens	Senior Programme Officer at United Nations
Trustee – World Bank		
	Mr Jonathan Caldicott	Sr Financial Officer, Development Finance
CREWS Secretariat		
	Mr John Harding	Head
	Ms Catherine Thompson	Senior Secretary
	Ms Silvi Llosa (on-line)	Consultant
	Ms Bonnie Gavin (on-line)	Consultant

Annex II - Agenda

Wednesday 8 November 2017

- 13.00 – 13.20** Item 1 – Welcome by the Chair, Objectives of the Meeting and Adoption of the Agenda
- 13.20 – 14.30** Item 2 – Status and Results of the CREWS Programme
- 14.30 – 15.15** Item 3 – Review of CREWS Projects for Approval
- 15.15 – 16.00** Item 4 – CREWS Analytics for Investment Effectiveness
- 16.00 – 16.45** Item 5 – Financing Plan for the CREWS FIF
- 16.45 – 17.15** Item 6 – Any Other Business and Dates for the 6th and 7th Meetings
- 17.15 – 17.30** Item 7 – Review of Proceedings and Closing Remarks

Annex III - Summary of Steering Committee Financing Decisions

Project Title and reference	Timeframe	Allocation to each Implementing Partner in USDeq. millions		Total
		WMO	fees	
Papua New Guinea Weather and Climate Early Warning System (CREWS/CProj/08/Papua New Guinea)	3 years, October 2017 – September 2020	1,460,000	190,000	1,650,000
Caribbean Lessons Learnt on Early Warning Systems Following the Caribbean 2017 Hurricane Season (CREWS/CProj/05/Lessons Learnt Caribbean)	8 months, December 2017 – July 2018	280,000	36,000	316,000
Total		1,740,000	226,000	
Total (with fees)		1,966,000		